

The History and Theory of Legal Practice in China

Toward a Historical-Social Jurisprudence

Edited by

Philip C. C. Huang and Kathryn Bernhardt



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

The history and theory of legal practice in China : toward a historical-social jurisprudence / Edited by Philip C. C. Huang and Kathryn Bernhardt.

p. cm. — (The social sciences of practice ; 3)

ISBN 978-90-04-27643-7 (hardback : alk. paper)—ISBN 978-90-04-27644-4 (e-book) 1. Law—China—History. 2. Jurisprudence—China—history. 3. Justice, Administration of—China—History. I. Huang, Philip C., 1940– author editor of compilation. II. Bernhardt, Kathryn, author editor of compilation.

KNN122.H57 2014

349.51—dc23

2014012708

This publication has been typeset in the multilingual 'Brill' typeface. With over 5,100 characters covering Latin, IPA, Greek, and Cyrillic, this typeface is especially suitable for use in the humanities. For more information, please see brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 2214-952X

ISBN 978 90 04 27643 7 (hardback)

ISBN 978 90 04 27644 4 (e-book)

Copyright 2014 by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Global Oriental and Hotei Publishing. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Authorization to photocopy items for internal or personal use is granted by Koninklijke Brill nv provided that the appropriate fees are paid directly to The Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Suite 910, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Fees are subject to change.

This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Contents

Author Biographies xi

Series Foreword xv

Editor's Introduction 1

Philip C. C. Huang

PART 1

Women and the Law 27

1 A Ming-Qing Transition in Chinese Women's History?

The Perspective from Law 29

Kathryn Bernhardt

Scholarship on Women in the Late Ming and Qing 30

The Ming-Qing Present 33

The Past 34

The Future 36

The Perspective from Law 40

Betrothal 40

Marriage 42

Divorce 44

Property 45

The Peasantization of Law 46

2 Women's Choices under the Law: Marriage, Divorce, and Illicit Sex in the Qing and the Republic 51

Philip C. C. Huang

Part I: The Qing 53

The Legal Categories and Pertinent Laws 53

Qing Constructions 59

Variant Concepts in Legal and Social Practice 62

Women as Victims 65

The Burdens of Passive Agency 69

Part 2: The Republic 73

Women's Agency in Guomindang Law 73

Women's Agency in Practice 78

3 Marriage, Law, and Revolution: Divorce Law Practice in the Shaan-Gan-Ning Border Region	96
<i>Liu Yang</i>	
Evolution of Marriage Legislation	99
Divorce Suits in the Context of Revolution	103
Women in Divorce Litigation	107
<i>Kangshu</i>	108
<i>Gongjiaren</i>	112
<i>Peasant Women</i>	117
Peasant Husbands in Divorce Litigation	121
<i>Tiaobo and Peimi</i>	121
<i>A Peasant Husband Battles to Save His Marriage</i>	124
Conclusion	129
4 从事实别居到法律别居: 清代到民国时期夫妻别居的权利和义务 (From De Facto Separation to Legal Separation: Rights and Obligations in Husband-Wife Separations from the Qing to the Republic)	133
<i>李红英 (Hongying Li)</i>	
一 问题的提出	134
二 从清代到民国: 事实别居的权利和义务的变化	136
三 民国时期: 法律别居的权利和义务的扩大和明确	139
四 别居现象与妇女权利的关系	143
(一) 生存理性与妇女权利	143
(二) 别居与离婚的利益比较	146
(三) 事实别居与法律别居的比较	148
结论	149
5 Representation and Practice in “Privately Settling Illicit Sex Offenses,” with Attention to the “Third Realm” from the Late Imperial Period to the Present	150
<i>Fenghua Jing</i>	
Research from Contemporary Case Records of “Privately Settling Illicit Sex Offenses”	151
“Privately Settling Illicit Sex Offenses” in the Qing Code	153
“Privately Settling Illicit Sex Offenses” in Qing Legal Practice	156
<i>Private Settlement before the State Was Aware of the Matter</i>	156
<i>Private Settlement after the State Was Aware of the Matter</i>	157
Changes in the Modern Conception of Illicit Sex Crimes	161
<i>A Substantive Split in “Privately Settling Illicit Sex Offenses”</i>	161
<i>Rape Cases and Public Prosecution</i>	162

Private Settlement of Rape Cases under the Public Prosecution System	163
<i>Private Settlement in the Absence of Prosecution</i>	163
<i>Withdrawing a Complaint</i>	164
Rape and Complaint by the Victim Herself	167
PART 2	
Custom, Mediation, and Law	173
6 Between Informal Mediation and Formal Adjudication:	
The Third Realm of Qing Civil Justice	175
<i>Philip C. C. Huang</i>	
Three Stages in a Qing Lawsuit	178
<i>The Initial Stage</i>	180
<i>The Middle Stage</i>	188
<i>Resolution in the Middle Stage</i>	189
<i>The Final Stage: The Court Session</i>	193
Justice in the Third Realm	197
<i>The Court as Catalyst Prompting a Settlement</i>	197
<i>The Role of Court Opinion</i>	199
<i>The Xiangbao</i>	201
Sources of Abuse in the Third Realm	203
<i>Xiangbao Power and Abuse</i>	203
<i>Runner Power and Abuse</i>	205
Formal, Informal, and Third-Realm Justice	208
State and Society Seen through the Judicial Process	210
7 近代中国“法律渊源”中的“习惯法” (“Customary Law” as the “Source of Law” in Modern China)	215
余盛峰 (<i>Shengfeng Yu</i>)	
一 “习惯法”语词的创制：与诸国民法典的比较	216
二 “风土人情、习俗土例”与“习惯法”	222
三 “习惯法”，抑或“亚欧礼教之殊”？	227
四 继受法与固有法的冲突	232
五 民初大理院的司法实践：“习惯法”的成立要件	234
六 国民党时期习惯法理论的内在矛盾	237
七 结语：在古今中西之间	241

- 8 尸体危险的法外生成: 以当代中国的藉尸抗争事例为中心的分析
(*Extralegal Origins of the Dangers of a Corpse: An Analysis of Case Examples of "Protesting with a Corpse" in Contemporary China*) 246
 尤陈俊 (*Chenjun You*)
- 一 从“蔡发旺事件”谈起 246
- 二 “事件的类型学”再思考: 藉尸抗争行为的反法治性 249
 (一) 20世纪80年代以来藉尸抗争事例的广泛分布 249
 (二) 法外收场: 事件类型学的另一面 254
- 三 尸体危险的生成机制/观念 256
 (一) “图赖得利”的社会记忆 257
 (二) “丧葬”礼仪的社会功能 260
 (三) “非理死”中的“冤抑”生成 261
- 四 尸体危险与法治框架下的国家权力强化 264

PART 3

The System of “Turning Oneself In” in Criminal Justice 269

9 The System of “Turning Oneself In” in Qing and Contemporary China: Some Reflections on Legal Modernism 271

Zhengyang Jiang

- Indigenous Characteristics and Continuity 275
- Changes in the System 280
 Changes in the Conception of Legal Subject 281
 Changes in the Evaluation of Motive 285
 Changes in Terms of to Whom One Could Turn Oneself In 291
 Changes in the Outcome of Turning Oneself In 293
- Reflections on Modernism 301
 Rational Formalism 301
 Instrumental Rationality 302
 Individualism 303

PART 4

Administration and Law 307

10 Centralized-Minimalist Government: The Lake Weishan Issue and the Chinese Mediator System of Government 309

Lei Tian

The Lake Weishan Issue: Background	315	
How the Policy of the Central Government Was Thwarted		318
<i>A Working Group is Sent to the Lake Area</i>	318	
<i>The Inter-Ministerial Report and Its Plan</i>	319	
<i>The Xuzhou Meeting</i>	321	
<i>A Review</i>	323	
How the Central Government Worked Out a Decision		324
<i>Cui Naifu's Little Solution Plan</i>	324	
<i>Wherever There's Trouble, Give It to Shandong</i>	327	
<i>The Central Government Drops the Gavel</i>	331	
<i>Why THREE Documents?</i>	333	
Centralized-Minimalist Government	336	
<i>The Structure of Centralized Authority</i>	337	
<i>The Daily Model of Minimalist Governance</i>	339	

PART 5

International Law 345

II Sovereignty and "Civilization": International Law and East Asia in the Nineteenth Century	347	
<i>Junnan Lai</i>		
"International Society" in Nineteenth-Century International Law		349
"Civilization"	349	
<i>Positivism</i>	353	
Different Responses of China and Japan	356	
<i>China: "The Just Law of All Nations"</i>	356	
<i>Japan: Bunmei kaika</i>	357	
The First Sino-Japanese War: "Civilization" and "Barbarism"		361
<i>Japan: A Warpath toward "Civilization"</i>	361	
<i>Japan: A Big Show</i>	364	
<i>China: A Feeble Voice</i>	369	
The West: Evaluating Students	370	
<i>Japan: Earning a High Score</i>	370	
<i>China: Flunking Out</i>	372	
Conclusion	374	

PART 6	
Theoretical Explorations	381
12 以实践逻辑再阐释象征资本——基于象征资本的多重面向与运用 (Using the “Logic of Practice” to Explicate “Symbolic Capital”— Based on the Multiple Faces and Uses of Symbolic Capital)	383
<i>王海侠 (Haixia Wang)</i>	
一 布迪厄的学术与政治	384
二 象征资本的概念梳理	386
(一) 象征资本的载体与依附性	386
(二) 象征资本的建构与转化	388
(三) 象征资本的双重获致与积累	391
三 象征资本在实践中的多重运用	394
(一) 内向性的正向作用	395
(二) 外向性的正向运用	398
(三) 否定性运用	400
四 象征资本解构之中有建设	409
13 Reconstructing Max Weber’s “Sociology of Law”: The Power of Idealism and the Limits of Objectivity	413
<i>Junnan Lai</i>	
Reconstructing Concepts: “Form/Substance”	416
<i>The Categories of “Legal Thinking”</i>	416
“Substantive Rationality”	419
<i>The Power of Dualism: Form/Materie</i>	421
“ <i>The Anti-Formal Tendencies in Modern Legal Development</i> ”	424
Reconstructing the Theses: Law and Capitalism	427
<i>Weber’s Hypotheses</i>	427
<i>Weber’s Anxiety and Decision</i>	428
<i>A Reconstruction of the Relation between Law, Capitalism, and “Rationality”</i>	431
Conclusion	437